CS1/06-00nn

INCITS
InterNational Committee for Information Technology Standards
INCITS Secretariat, Information Technology Industry Council (ITI)
1250 Eye St. NW, Suite 200, Washington, DC 20005
Telephone 202-737-8888; Fax 202-638-4922

Date: June 12, 2006
Replaces: n/a
Reply to: Deborah J. Spittle
Phone: (202) 626-5746
Email: dspittle@itic.org

Draft Minutes
INCITS Task Group CS1.1, Role-Based Access Control (RBAC)

Meeting Number 3
May 3, 2006
8:30 a.m. – 10:10 a.m.
Room 660, NIST North Building
National Institute of Standards and Technology (NIST)
Gaithersburg, MD 20899

Agenda Point of Contact:
Ed Coyne
703-824-5974
ed.coyne@med.va.gov

---

1. Administrative Matters (E. Coyne)

1.1 Call to Order

   Mr. Coyne called the meeting to order at 8:40 AM

1.2 Roll call of participants

Mr. Coyne called the roll of members present at NIST and via teleconference. Attendees indicated whether they would be Principal (voting) members or Advisory members. There were not enough voting members present for a quorum of 4 to approve minutes or draft agenda.

1.3 Membership in Attendance

Attendee	Organization	Membership	Contact Information
Rich Kissel	NIST	Alternate	NIST 100 Bureau Drive Stop 8930 Gaithersburg, MD 20899-8930 301-975-5017 rkissel@nist.gov
Rick Kuhn	NIST	Principal	NIST 100 Bureau Drive Stop 8930 Gaithersburg, MD 20899-8930 301-975-3337 kuhn@nist.gov
Tim Weil	BAH	Principal	Booz | Allen | Hamilton 8251 Greensboro Drive - Suite 511 McLean, Va. 22102 703.377.0948 301.452.3641 weil.tim@bah.com
Mike Hogan	NIST	Alternate	NIST 100 Bureau Drive Stop 8900 Gaithersburg MD 20899-8900 301-975-2926 301-975-2378 m.hogan@nist.gov
Dan Benigni	NIST	Ex-officio	NIST 100 Bureau Drive Stop 8930 Gaithersburg MD 20899-8930 301-975-3279 dbenigni@nist.gov
Ed Coyne	VHA HIA	Principal	VHA Health Information Architecture Office 2407 Jackson Parkway Vienna VA 22180 703-573-0735 ed.coyne@med.va.gov
Kevin Sculley	Beta Systems	Alternate	kevin.scully@betasystems.com
Debra Bergeris	Beta Systems	Alternate	debra.bergeris@betasystems.com

1.4 Appointment of recording secretary

Mr. Kuhn agreed to be recording secretary.

1.5 INCITS Antitrust Guidelines
REF: http://www.incits.org/inatrust.htm

Mr. Coyne described the significance of the INCITS Antitrust Guidelines and noted the reference for review by members.

2. Approval of Draft Agenda

REF:CS1/05-0156

An insufficient number of voting members were present to approve the draft agenda.

3. Approval of Minutes of Last Meeting (31 Jan 06)

An insufficient number of voting members were present to approve the minutes of the last meeting.

4. INCITS Project 1794 - Review documents and current work related to formulating a standard on role-based access control implementation requirements

> **REF:** INCITS 359-2004 American National Standard for Information Technology - Role-Based Access Control
> **REF:** CS1/05-0082 Project Proposal - Requirements for the Implementation of Role Based Access Control (RBAC)
> **REF:** CS1/06-0057 Draft Standard for Implementation of RBAC
> **REF:** CS1/06-0132 Draft RBAC Use Cases

The current draft RBAC implementation standard was reviewed section by section and commented upon. Changes were incorporated into a working copy that will be distributed to the Task Group members or further review.

5. Other Business

- Possible new projects – Enterprise Dynamic Access Control (EDAC), role engineering. Role engineering proposal not written, but we have a draft for EDAC.
- Ed asked for other areas that have some interest.
- Mike would like to add to next agenda – where the work might go internationally.
    - RBAC 359-2004 could go international. ISO to do new working group structure – have had 3 working groups in SC27. WG 2 – technical standards for encryption – WG 3 common criteria assessments

- Two new groups – one on security controls and services, network security standards; also another one for new things - identity management. Will have 5 working groups – RBAC doesn't fit into any of these, but might be added to the identity management group. Need to consider how SC27 is reorganized. Could fast track ANSI standard as ISO standard.

6. Review Action Items from this Meeting

- Get together next few weeks with small group to add content to draft implementation standard.
- Confirm schedule for future meetings – next for 14 August, with CS1 meeting.
- Need to determine good time for CS1.1 meeting during that
- Three organizations to do 2nd draft

7. Future Meetings

Planned CS1 and CS1.1 meetings:

CS1.1	1/31/06	San Jose, CA
CS1	2/1-2/06	San Jose, CA
CS1	3/29-30/06	Austin, TX
CS1.1	5/3/06 at NIST	Gaithersburg, MD
CS1.1	8/14/06 at NIST	Gaithersburg, MD
CS1	8/15-16/06 at NIST	Gaithersburg, MD
CS1.1	10/2/06	Atlanta, GA
CS1	10/3-4/06	Atlanta, GA

8. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 10:10 am.

Note: Meeting notes are attached

Meeting Notes

CS1.1 meeting 3 May 3, 2006

Not enough for a quorom to approve minutes or draft agenda.

Documents
Use cases
Draft standard

Use cases need a number to discuss in the meeting.

Mike noted that we need to include approval of draft minutes in agenda.
Cs1.1/06/0055

Vice chairman and recording secretary – need permanent people.

Haven't added anything to the draft standard since last Jan.
placeholders –
Combinations of components - 6.1 need to specify combinations that are required for someone to say they are compliant with the RBAC standard. Will do this through use cases – what is really needed to do RBAC, what combinations make sense.
Use cases –
Ed specified example of adduser;
Kept section headings from rbac standard –
Tim Weil – he sent the draft to several people who are reviewing it. They seem to be comfortable with it; will come back with comments later.

Ed – haven't gotten to where we have draft info for other sections such as constraints.

Mike – lots of interest in project, but not clear how many are participating. Mike suggests having one or two champions making up a complete draft standard instead of asking for contributions.

Discussed having different meeting times.

Beta systems participants
Kevin Sculley
Debra Brageris
Will have two other participants, Martin Kuhlman and Rene Weil.

Ed would like comments on which combinations of RBAC features make sense.

Ed reviewed things in draft standard.

Reviewed idea of having a draft developed by a few, then having rest of group review and approve.

Will ask for contributions today.
Get draft and ask for comments before August meeting; work on revision in the meeting.
Augusr meeting – 3rd draft, put out for ballot. Want voting on forwarding for public review.
Debra – would like to have Beta person participating, also NIST and VA.

Everyone should send out their schedule for doing a meeting for draft.
Debra – send cc to Rene

Tim – good approach, but need to see how to get others involved, not just local people.
Ed says Mike Davis in San Diego might be able to.

Need to find out status of EDAC project proposal. Could be a reference implementation of RBAC. Modular with dynamic roles and permissions.

Dan waiting to do EDAC ballot after Madrid meeting mid may. Results will be handled at Aug meeting of CS1.

More work to be considered on how to define roles, role engineering.

Ed will send out email to determine when to work on draft.

Tim will be at Burton and Gartner workshops in June
Tim suggests circulating info about CS1.1 at this meeting.
Mike – use approved project proposal as the official statement of work.
This is document 82
Tim – Jerry Gable – Burton group – role engineering expert.

Some discussion of interoperability and XACML data model.
Tim – mention use cases in draft standard.
Debra – some books about LDAP and others that do RBAC work

Discussion of how to encourage participation in CS1.1 – Burton meeting, RBAC web site, SACMAT meeting.

Debra will send a note to Ed with contact info for drafting meeting.